Projecto CiMa:

A case study on VSO Guinea Bissau's in-service teacher training project for regional secondary science and maths teachers



Prepared by Roshelle Filart, VSO Education Volunteer, 2003-2006 28 April 2006





Projecto CiMa: A case study on VSO Guinea Bissau's inservice teacher training project for regional secondary science and maths teachers

Prepared by Roshelle Filart, VSO Education Volunteer, 2003-2006 28 April 2006

Despite numerous challenges it has faced over the last five years, VSO's In-service Teacher Training (INSETT) Project for regional secondary science teachers, co-financed by the European Commission and VSO has become one of the few successful education programme interventions in Guinea Bissau. The purpose of this case study is to document the collective and cumulative learning experiences of the project as it has evolved and to share this learning more widely with VSO and its partners working in education. It attempts to highlight some of the key factors that have made the INSETT project a success despite the difficult context in which it operates. Research, including document reviews, interviews and focus group discussions, was conducted during the last year of the project, although the scope of the study covers a period of 10 years. The case study will be of interest to those involved in educational project development, teacher training and monitoring and evaluation.

Contents

Overview of Project	3
Context and need for the project	
Development of the Project	
Key challenges and effects on the project	
Factors related to original project assumptions invalidated over time	7
Key Changes to the Project	9
Current project activities (2004- 2006)	11
Project Coordination and Management	13
Lessons Learned	14
Annex 1: Summary of original VSO Guinea Bissau INSETT Proposal	16
Annex 2: CiMa INSETT Project Facts	19
Annex 3: Timeline of events	20
Annex 4: Logical Framework for CiMa INSETT Project 2003	22
Annex 5: Logical Framework for VSO/EU INSETT Project (CiMa) - revised October 2005.	23

List of Abbreviations & Acronyms

CiMa Project Ciências e Matemáticas (Science & Mathematics) Project

EC European Commission

EDW Education Development Worker (refers to both Guinean project staff and

VSO volunteers. Text clarifies where distinctions exist.)

FCFA Franc Communauté Financière Africaine (West African CFA Franc)

GDP Gross domestic product

INDE Instituto Nacional para o Desenvolvimento da Educação (National Institute

for the Development of Education)

INGO International non-governmental organisation

INSETT In-service Teacher Training IT Information Technology

MoE Ministério da Educação Nacional (National Ministry of Education)

PAEB/Firkidia Projecto de Apoio de Ensino Básico/Firkidia (World Bank Basic Education

Support Project)

VSO Voluntary Service Overseas

Overview of project

VSO's In-Service Teacher Training Project for regional science and mathematics teachers, more commonly known as the CiMa Project, is one of a limited number of government or INGO-led interventions directly addressing needs in secondary education in Guinea Bissau. At present, it is the only project of its kind to provide continuous professional support for inservice secondary teachers. This support comes in the form of training seminars in pedagogy and subject content during the academic year, which are followed up by classroom observations and coaching by the same seminar facilitators. The CiMa Project also produces educational resources for use in the classroom and organises two high-profile annual events, the National Secondary Science and Mathematics Teachers' Conference and the Regional Science and Mathematics Competition for Secondary Students, commemorating International Children's Day.

The CiMa INSETT Project is an important component of VSO Guinea Bissau's Education Programme and has contributed greatly to the strategic aim "to improve educational opportunities for all Guineans but particularly youth and those in the regions."

Co-financed by VSO and the European Commission, the CiMa INSETT project is highly regarded by many education stakeholders as a model for future Ministry of Education inservice teacher training programmes. Its success in reaching out to marginalized and disadvantaged teachers and students in the regions has also attracted additional financial support from Premier Oil plc, a leading independent UK-based oil and gas company, currently prospecting for oil off the coast of Guinea Bissau.

VSO has invested greatly in building the capacity of the CiMa INSETT project staff and the project has many achievements to be proud of as a result. The project has also had to overcome its share of difficulties and continues to evolve in response to the challenging environment in which it operates. Although the scope and nature of the project – the teacher training programme for regional secondary teachers and the educational resource development component – have remained true to the original project document, project coordination and implementation of activities have changed significantly over the last four years in response to both external and internal circumstances.

Sadly, VSO will close its country programme in June 2006 after 18 years of providing skilled volunteers to work in education, health, secure livelihoods and HIV and AIDS in Guinea Bissau. The decision follows a Strategic Resource Allocation review by VSO's Senior Management Team in light of its corporate strategic framework, Focus for Change. The review found that despite the best efforts of volunteers and partners and large financial investment, VSO struggles to be effective in Guinea Bissau.

The impending closure of VSO Guinea Bissau has several serious implications for the CiMa INSETT Project. Although the project cannot continue in its present form beyond 31 March 2006, due to the end of EC co-financing, VSO is committed to ensuring that its partners in Guinea Bissau and other potential stakeholders sustain the exemplary work of the CiMa project in some manner.

Context and need for project

Guinea Bissau consistently ranks as one of the 10 poorest nations in the world. In 2005, the Guinea Bissau was 172 out of 177 countries on the United Nations Human Development Index. Life expectancy at birth is a mere 45 years and the infant mortality rate is 130 per 1000 live births.

More than 80% of the population lives under the poverty benchmark of US \$1/day, with the majority affected being in rural areas. Agriculture, the principal economic activity in the rural regions, accounts for 50% of GDP, 85% of employment and virtually all exports. The remaining 50% comes from trade and government. The country has virtually no industrial or manufacturing base although the services sector, both private and public, has grown in the last few years.

Clearly if Guinea Bissau is to develop a stable and diversified economic base, it can only do so with an educated and skilled labour force. A sound secondary education plays an important role in equipping young people with practical skills and knowledge that can be applied to a broader range of job opportunities and sectors. This is essential to enable Guinea Bissau to participate in an increasingly complex and technological global economy.

The national education system has been chronically ill-equipped and under-resourced to support the human and economic development goals of Guinea Bissau. When Guinea Bissau gained independence from Portugal in 1974, the education system it inherited consisted of a handful of urban-based lower primary schools and a single secondary *liceu*, located in the capital, Bissau. Formal education in the Portuguese colony was biased to serve the needs of the elite administrative class and those Africans who did gain access were generally limited to four years of primary school. The illiteracy rate of adult Guineans at independence was a staggering 98%.

Given the overwhelming needs of the education sector in Guinea Bissau and the severe financial constraints of the government following the revolutionary war, secondary education reform has lagged behind the large-scale efforts to improve quality and access to primary education. Multilateral and bilateral assistance since 1974 has generally focused on provision of universal primary education and non-formal education to address adult illiteracy, in accordance with Government's commitments to meet the World Declaration on Education For All and the United Nations Millennium Development Goals for 2015.

The rapid expansion of primary education in the 1990's led to increased numbers of students seeking access to secondary and higher levels of education. Unable to cope with the growing demand, the MoE has not made secondary education compulsory and students are required to pay tuition fees. National secondary schools were built in some of the larger urban centers but as late as 1992, only the secondary school in Bissau offered the final two years of secondary education. By 1995-96, four schools offered 10th and 11th grades but of these, three were located in Bissau and the fourth in the nearby administrative region of Biombo.

The quality of secondary education provided in any event has been questionable, given that only 30% of teachers had actually completed secondary education themselves and virtually none had any formal pre-service professional teacher training. Many struggled with an out-of-date curriculum that was of little relevance in a Guinean context and teaching resources and equipment, particularly in the sciences, were in scarce supply.

The poor indicators for secondary education are a direct result of limited opportunities and decades of neglect. When the CiMa project was first conceived in 1998, only 1% of those who entered first grade actually progressed through and completed all 11 years of education. In 1999, 17 public and 10 private secondary schools accommodated 26,000 students or 6% of the eligible age group, well below the average of 18% for sub-Saharan Africa.² Today, the functional literacy rate for Guineans 15 years and older is still just 40%.

_

¹ IMF Country Report no. 05/93 (2005)

² Interim National Poverty Reduction Strategy (2000)

Development of project

The 1998-99 civil war in Guinea Bissau had disastrous consequences on both the VSO Country Programme and the development of the project. The war forced an evacuation of all volunteers and a two-year suspension of the programme, although the programme office remained open with a skeleton staff. While the country programme resumed in late 2000 upon the successful installation of a democratically elected government, the post-conflict reconstruction period has continued to be marked by serious political and economic instability that greatly affected the functioning of both VSO and the CiMa Project.

The development of the CiMa Project can be divided into roughly two phases: pre-1998 civil war project proposal development and post-war project implementation from 2000 onwards.

Pre-war project proposal development

- VSO's comparative advantage in Guinea Bissau: VSO opened a programme office in Guinea Bissau in 1988. In 1993, it established a formal partnership with the MoE and began recruiting secondary maths, science and Portuguese volunteer teachers for regional secondary schools to fill the severe shortage of qualified, skilled Guinean teachers. In keeping with its shift to a more programmatic approach, VSO also began recruiting teacher trainers to work at the national secondary teacher training college, Escola Normal Superior Tchico Té, and IT trainers for the National Centre for Administrative Training, CENFA.
- 1997 INSETT pilot project: The idea for an in-service teacher-training project arose from requests VSO volunteers received for additional science and maths training and classroom support from their fellow teachers. Volunteers began developing weekend and after school workshops for teachers on an ad hoc basis. At the same time the MoE was also interested in developing a more formal in-service training programme. In 1997, VSO approved a one-year pilot INSETT project initiated by three VSO volunteers in three regional secondary schools.
- Proposal to develop 4-year In-service Teacher Training project: The results of the pilot project were presented at a national teachers workshop in 1998, involving VSO education volunteers, over 60 teachers and school directors, and representatives from the MoE. Teachers wanted more professional training and better teaching resources and the MoE agreed that the pilot project should be extended over a four-year period to eventually encompass all maths and science teachers in all regional secondary schools.

Following the positive response, VSO staff and volunteers initiated talks with potential funders and implementing partners, including the EC and the World Bank. At the time, the latter was preparing a seven-year strategic programme, PAEB/Firkidja, to assist Government in improving the provision of primary education that featured a component of in-service primary and lower secondary teacher training. The EC expressed interest in supporting the VSO project proposal under its NGO Co-Financing Scheme and suggested the possibility of releasing funds as early as January 1999. A detailed proposal was drafted and submitted to the EC in 1998 with an operational start date of September 1999. (*Annex 1: Summary of project proposal and objectives*).

Post-war project implementation

• First volunteers arrive, project coordinator hired: When VSO resumed its operations in September 2000 the CiMa INSETT Project proposal was submitted as a priority to the EC. It was approved in November 2000 and the first three volunteers recruited for the

project arrived in February 2001. They were sent to Farim and Canchungo to work with the Regional District Offices and the secondary schools to begin project activities. In July 2001, one of the volunteers who developed the original proposal was hired to coordinate the project.

- Mid-Project review: In June 2002, VSO sent a consultant from its Programme Development and Evaluation team to develop monitoring and evaluation strategies. The project was also subjected to a mid-project review in May 2003 by a monitor selected by the EC. The report assessed five areas: relevance and quality of the original project concept, effectiveness of project implementation to date, actual effectiveness, current impact and sustainability. Both reports suggested that the project revisit its original objectives in light of the challenges and difficulties that it continued to face.
- Project extension to 2006: In 2003, the CiMa Project petitioned the EC to grant a one-year, no-cost extension of the project. Due to the project setbacks in the first and second years of the project, much of the funding was not spent and deferred and many activities were delayed. Despite earlier problems, the project was able to carry out many of its activities and has seen a marked rise in teacher participation its third and fourth years, attracting additional financial support from Premier Oil plc in 2004. The EC approved a one-year extension to 31 March 2006.

Key challenges and effects on project

While all projects must overcome challenges and setbacks, VSO's CiMa Project was particularly beleaguered by factors beyond its control that had compounded and unforeseen effects.

External factors

Factor	Effects on the project
1998-99 civil war: Despite economic gains of the early 1990s, Government fails to address sense of exclusion felt by most of the population due to disparate distribution of wealth and serious governance issues. This results in a coup and civil war. Continuing political and economic instability following war: New government unable to address basic causes of the war. Economy never reaches pre-war growth levels because donors and private sector reluctant to reinvest in Guinea Bissau. Most immediate aid earmarked for post-conflict recovery and infrastructure rehabilitation rather than long-term social development.	 Forced evacuation of all volunteers and suspension of VSO country programme Volunteers involved in the development of original INSETT project proposal or teaching in secondary schools no longer available to continue in the project Project launch delayed by two years Government unable to pay salaries to civil servants, including public school teachers, resulting in numerous labour strikes throughout duration of project CiMa Project and VSO absorb all costs of Guinean and volunteer EDWs 2002/03 academic year declared null and void because only 10% of curriculum taught due to strikes Classroom observation component of project cancelled numerous times
Military coup, September 2003: Public dissatisfaction with government and frustration over postponement of elections leads to non-violent coup ousting President Kumba lala and leading to installation of transitional governing council.	 Last minute cancellation of 2003 National Teacher's Conference Delay in start of CiMa programme for 2003/04 school year
Weakened administrative structures	MoE officials who had been involved in the

within MoE: Since 2000, eight Ministers of Education appointed, resulting in many staff and departmental changes. Attempts to pass educational policy reforms stalled numerous times. MoE has difficulty sustaining existing projects and initiating new ones. Very little preservation of institutional memory.

- earlier project proposal were no longer in the MoE after the war
- Ten-month delay in secondment of first two Guinean EDWs to the project
- Skills-sharing exchanges between regional and Bissau-based teachers cancelled
- CiMa Project Advisory Committee has difficulties convening regular update meetings
- Proposed collaboration with INDE in 1998 to review the national science curriculum and produce student workbooks does not occur
- Links with pre-service secondary science and maths teacher trainers at national teacher training college never developed

Expansion of secondary school system: Despite difficulties, several new secondary schools were built in the regions to accommodate the growing numbers of students completing primary education

- Number of project schools increases annually from original 15 in first year to 24 in final year of project
- Increase in schools to support more report areas has resource and time implications not foreseen in the original project proposal

Factors related to original project assumptions invalidated over time

Original Assumption	Reality	Effects on project
Volunteers to be recruited through NGO in Portugal: In 1990s VSO has arrangement with Portuguese NGO OIKOS to recruit Portuguese speaking volunteers for country programmes in Mozambique and Guinea Bissau, eliminating need for extended and costly language training	shortage of trained maths and science teachers worldwide, let alone fluent in Portuguese VSO/OIKOS collaboration ends due to difficulties recruiting experienced Portuguese teachers reluctant to leave system difficult working environment due to political instability, poverty and lack of basic necessities, multiple languages makes it difficult to recruit and retain volunteers	 Project never has full complement of VSO volunteers in any given year Only 3 of envisioned 4 offices opened, 3rd office (Bambadinca) opens in 2003 after 2 year delay One volunteer splits time between Bula and Mansoa offices Early return of two project coordinators and three volunteers due to health and personal reasons
English speaking volunteers to receive language training in Lisbon: Although not explicitly stated in the project proposal because of the abovementioned assumption, prevailing practice at the time of the proposal was that volunteers received intensive language training in Lisbon prior to placement	 VSO in general has difficulties recruiting volunteers willing to learn second languages VSO decides that it is more cost-effective and beneficial for volunteers to receive intensive language training in-country While Portuguese is official language, it is not widely spoken in Guinea Bissau especially in rural areas Only 1 of 9 volunteers recruited in 5 years of project is a native 	Delay in implementing activities, especially production of workbooks as volunteers learn Portuguese

	Portuguese speaker, while only 2 others have had	
	previous language training Many education volunteers forced to learn two languages: Portuguese for work and at least some Creole for daily activities	
Project "Link Teachers": Each liceu participating in project would have a link teacher to provide logistical support to EDWs by coordinating seminars and classroom observations. These were originally assumed to be currently serving VSO volunteer teachers, graduate teachers from Portugal or Guinean teachers who had participated in original pilot.	VSO secondary teachers participating in pilot project evacuated due to war VSO recruitment office in Portugal closed (see above) VSO develops new strategic framework, and as a general policy stops placing teachers in schools and focuses on recruiting teacher trainers High turnover of teachers in regions means many who participated in original pilot no longer available to be link teachers	 No link teachers ever identified Responsibility for logistics, coordinating seminars and classroom observations falls on project EDWs Training seminars take place in project offices instead of at schools as envisioned in project proposal, requiring teachers to travel
Logical framework developed and baseline data collected before start of project: Logical framework not requested by EC at the time of initial project proposal; this was to be developed with the help of an external M&E expert to be contracted at the start of the project	 No baseline data ever collected at start of project due to delays in hiring of project coordinator, let alone external M&E expert No new needs assessment or situational analysis to validate project objectives, activities and assumptions conducted after war and before project implementation Project logical framework developed only in third year of project in accordance with new EC project guidelines 	 First volunteers have difficulties in following proposed work plan, implementing activities and meeting annual objectives Difficulties in measuring actual changes as a result of project activities Each regional office begins collecting data about teachers and seminars but methods not consistent among offices Standardized monitoring tools (teacher observation sheets) developed only in the third year of project Systematic collection and analysis of data occurs only in 4th and 5th years of project
"Collective development" of 17,200 student workbooks: Seminars would focus on producing teaching materials and student workbooks and exercise sheets for each grade for all <i>liceus</i> participating in project	Many teachers lack basic knowledge in subject matter, let alone ability to teach the subject or create student workbooks, because they either lack pre-service training or have been asked to teach outside their discipline due to shortage of teachers Project team learns that INDE has proposal to review secondary	Seminars focus on subject content and basic pedagogy instead of production of student resources Project team undertakes responsibility for producing student workbooks but effort is time consuming and costly Team production slow due to VSO volunteers having to learn Portuguese and

	curriculum and is negotiating with Portugal to obtain student textbooks	lack of computers and electricity By 2003, only 5 of 50 planned workbooks produced Production of workbooks stopped to avoid duplication of work of INDE, esp. given all other project difficulties
Project to become an independent NGO after 4 years: By the end of the project, the Guinean EDWs would have the skills to form an independent NGO that could approach other donors for further funding and to contract services to the MoE	 Original project proposal vague on how this would come about other than through "on-the-job" training of Guinean EDWs Guinean EDWs gain experience in teacher training and classroom observation but not in project management or administration Project relies heavily on financial inputs from EC and VSO but has no concrete vision or plan for post-project financial sustainability Most donors, including EC, require implementing partner INGO with headquarters in a donor country, for financing or cofinancing Not likely that MoE would be able to contract NGO services given its recurrent financial difficulties Participation in the CiMa Project, although beneficial to teachers, not officially recognized by MoE as leading to any significant professional certification or corresponding wage increase 	Autonomy from MoE has allowed the project to continue despite difficulties but has also meant that MoE had little meaningful involvement in the project As it becomes clear that it is not feasible to create an NGO and that sustainability of the project outcomes lies with the MoE, project team struggles to involve MoE more in the last two years of the project (e.g. certificates have official seal of INDE, MoE involved in deciding future of CiMa activities and Guinean staff; greater involvement of pre-service teacher trainers at National Teacher Training College)

Key changes to project

The cumulative effects of both the external and internal factors outlined above resulted in many of the project activities being more than a year behind schedule and project funds remaining unspent or deferred to the following year. As it became obvious that the project could not meet its original objectives within the realities of post-war Guinea Bissau and was moving in a direction that was ultimately not self-sustainable, a thorough and candid evaluation of the entire project was undertaken. The participatory process involving project staff, teachers and other project partners was led by a consultant from VSO UK's Programme Development and Evaluation Unit during the second year of the project.

Changes to the project included:

Revised objectives and a new logical framework

Original project objectives (see Annex 1) were revised to reflect the realities of teachers and teaching in the regions and a new logical framework was developed as required by the EC (see Annex 4). The logical framework established measurable indicators against which the project activities could be monitored and significant changes could be assessed. The new project aim and objectives are:

Project Aim: To support teachers of Maths and Sciences in the regions in improving the quality of teaching; competence and confidence in their subject knowledge; and attitude toward their role as teachers

Project Objectives

- 1. To improve the quality of teaching by helping teachers to develop their existing teaching techniques
- 2. To support teacher in developing greater understanding of their academic disciplines and the ability to pass this on to their students
- 3. To raise self-esteem and standards of professional behaviour of teachers in regional secondary schools
- 4. To give project participants the skills and confidence necessary to continue the project

Before the 2005/06 academic year, the framework was revised to include more measurable indicators on the basis of data collected in the previous year.

Improved and standardized M&E tools and procedures

Following the development of the new logical framework, the project team became more systematic in its collection of data and monitoring of all project activities. Each office keeps track of teacher attendance at seminars and a folder of teachers observed. Data is collected on attendance at the National Teacher's Conference and participation in the regional science and mathematics competition.

Increased number of Guinean EDWs

Because the project has been unable to reach its full complement of 4 VSO volunteers in the project at any one time during the project cycle and the link teachers at project schools were never identified, four more Guinean teachers were hired as EDWs in September 2003. The project was finally able to open an office in Bambadinca to serve Gabú, Bafatá, Quinara and Tombali secondary after a delay of almost two years.

The project now has at least two EDWs with teaching experience in each of the four subject disciplines. The Mansoa and Bula regional offices operate with a minimum of two Guinean EDWs each. A VSO EDW liaises with both offices. The Bambadinca regional office has four Guinean EDWs and one VSO EDW due to the larger geographical area that it covers and the logistical difficulties in coordinating observations at more remote secondary schools.

Revised project schedule and project development weeks

The project team revised the annual project planning calendar in order to address management and sustainability issues. The monthly seminar/observation cycle was readjusted to include an extra week of overall project planning in activities in Bissau. These project development weeks also provided training and practical opportunities for Guinean EDWs to develop management and administration skills. The project team creates the

agenda to be discussed prior the development week and completes a report summarizing issues and action items to be followed up in the next development week.

Focus on production and use of teacher resources

Instead of costly student workbooks that would be limited in use, the project team focused on developing teaching resources from local materials for both the training seminars and use in classrooms. In the third year, the project began producing a Teacher's Manual and Agenda that was distributed to teachers attending the National Conference. The Manual included basic reference material and suggestions for classroom exercises for all the disciplines.

The second and third editions of the Manual were revised and published with financial support from Premier Oil. Four hundred and fifty copies of each edition were published and another 300 were revised and reprinted for the 2006-07 school year.

In the final year of the project, the project team salvaged the work of earlier volunteers and produced text and exercise booklets that teachers could use in the classroom with students. It also produced 28 science kits for each of the 24 project schools and CiMa offices (see below).

Current project activities (2004-2006)

Training seminars

Five-hour training seminars take place every Monday and Friday in the Bambadinca and Bula project offices. Each office offers approximately 30 seminars over the course of the school year. Seminar delivery has varied over the life of the project but more or less coincides with the national curriculum.

Seminar content has evolved to take into account teachers' needs and levels. Seminars aim to improve teachers' knowledge of secondary maths, physics, chemistry and biology. Seminars also cover pedagogy (didactics of science, formative and summative evaluation, questioning techniques, practicals and a component on HIV & AIDS).

In the fourth and fifth years, intensive seminars have been offered to teachers in the regions not covered by the project.

Teachers can claim transport and lunch expenses to attend the seminars from the project. The Bambadinca and Bula offices offer basic accommodation for those teachers who must stay overnight due to travel distance.

Teacher observations & monitoring

Classroom observations take place on Wednesdays and Thursdays. EDWs observe lessons to monitor whether project teachers are applying the lessons of the seminars. Before and after each observation, an EDW discusses planning, classroom management and any problems encountered by the teacher during the lesson. EDWs take on a coaching role during observations, giving advice and feedback. EDWs also adapt future seminars based on the expressed needs of teachers.

Resources for seminars

Instead of the proposed student workbooks, the project now focuses on producing resources for seminars. These include information sheets with subject content, suggestions

for student exercises, organizing practical activities and making no- or low-cost science teaching/lab equipment from locally available materials.

Resources for teachers

The most important resource that the CiMa Project produces is the Teachers Manual and Agenda. It has evolved every year based on teachers' comments and suggestions and includes curricula and syllabi for mathematics, biology, chemistry and physics up to ninth grade. It also has pages for lesson planning, recording student grades and ideas for student exercises and activities. All teachers attending the National Teacher's Conference, whether or not they are in a project school, receive the Teacher's Manual and Agenda.

In the final year, portable science kits containing simple equipment locally available materials were created and distributed to each project school. Each kit consists of simple science equipment (rules, test tubes, thermometers, beakers, mirrors, etc.) purchased in the UK that can be locked in a metal trunk. The kit also contains a list of in expensive locally available materials that can either be found or purchased and added to the trunk. The aim of the kit is to provide all materials necessary to conduct the experiments and demonstrations outlined in the Teacher's Manual.

Materials from the earlier student workbooks were converted into booklets of suggested texts and exercises for teachers to use with their students. Booklets covering each subject area were created for teachers of Years 7, 8 and 9.

International Children's Day Maths and Science Competition

The annual competition, which is open to all CiMa project schools, is the one event that EDWs and project teachers organize specifically for students. Although not a specific activity or objective of the original project proposal, the competition has become a highlight of the CiMa year and an opportunity to publicize the importance of science education.

A team of students, half of whom must be girls, and a teacher representing each of the project secondary schools compete in fun science and mathematics activities organized by each of the regional offices. The competition aims to promote an enjoyment of science by involving students, especially girls, in practical science activities and experiments that can be done using inexpensive, locally available materials.

National Secondary Science and Mathematics Teachers' Conference

With the exception of the first year and the third year of the project, the National Teachers' Conference has been held every September at the National Secondary Teacher Training College, before the start of the academic year. Attendance has increased substantially with each conference with 365 teachers, school directors and regional directors participating in 2005. Secondary teachers from non-project schools in Bissau and the administrative regions of Biombo and Bolama/Bijagos also attend every year.

The weeklong event provides teachers with opportunities to try various science experiments and exchange ideas and experiences with their colleagues. Project EDWs and guest presenters facilitate more than 40 sessions that include not only mathematics and sciences but also gender mainstreaming, professional development issues, HIV & AIDS and human rights. Every participating teacher receives a CiMa Manual and Agenda, as well as a subsidy to cover their travel and accommodation expenses in Bissau.

Guinean EDW training

To give the Guinean EDWs more skills and confidence in project management, they have increasingly been given more administrative responsibilities in addition to their teacher training work. During project development weeks, Guinean EDWs also attend training sessions on IT, motorcycle use and maintenance, accounting, project planning, fundraising and mainstreaming HIV and AIDS. Development weeks also give all EDWs an opportunity to learn from each other and share experiences.

Project Coordination and Management

Project Assets & Technical Resources

The CiMa Project has office space and equipment in the VSO Programme Office in Bissau. The Project also rents a house and provides a 4-wheel drive vehicle for the coordinator.

The project currently rents three offices/houses in each of the regions it serves. Each office has a training room and a reference library with books and teaching resources in Portuguese and other languages. The offices are equipped with computers, printers and solar panels for use by the EDWs. Each office also maintains two motorbikes.

Human resources

The project coordinator is responsible for coordinating project activities at a national level and planning the yearly calendar, overseeing project accounts and liaising between VSO, MoE and all project stakeholders.

Ten EDWs (8 Guinean and 2 VSO volunteers) are responsible for the daily administration of each regional office and the implementation of project activities. This includes planning and implementing the project seminar cycle.

Each regional office also employs local security guards and cleaners.

The VSO programme provides volunteer and logistic support as necessary.

Systems & Procedures

Accounts

The project coordinator manages the project's global accounts through the VSO financial system.

Each regional office is responsible for managing its monthly budget and expenditures. These include project recurrent costs such as rent, utilities, office stationery, petrol for the motorbikes and payment of teachers' expenses to attend seminars. Each office operates on average with a monthly budget of 300,000 to 600,000 FCFA (approximately £300 to £600).

To increase capacity, all EDWs rotate the responsibility for accounting every month. The EDW is responsible for signing the money out from the VSO office, making any payments, ensuring all vouchers are completed correctly, entering the accounts on the computer, presenting the accounts and receipts to VSO at the end of month.

The project coordinator approves all large and capital expenditures.

Planning

Although the logistics of scheduling observations is determined by each regional office due to staff and travel distance to schools, the overall CiMa calendar of seminars and

observations is designed to coincide with the national curriculum as much as possible. These are discussed during project development weeks in Bissau. (Report and agenda for following weeks)

Every Tuesday is designated an "office day" in the regional offices. Office days give EDWs a chance to discuss issues and coordinate activities specific to their offices.

EDWs are also responsible for planning and organizing the National Teacher's Conference and the International Children's Day Competition.

Monitoring and Evaluation

The project uses standardized forms and project team meetings to monitor and evaluate project activities. All forms are analyzed during the project development weeks in Bissau to chart progress and plan and improve future seminars and project activities.

Lesson observation forms are used by EDWs to analyze teacher performance in the classroom. The form includes sections on teaching methods used, subject knowledge covered, classroom management and areas for improvement.

Teachers also have an opportunity to give feedback on project activities through regular questionnaires that are also analyzed by the project team and are used for planning.

Seminar observation forms, completed by an EDW acting as an observer, are used to support discussion of content and delivery after each seminar. -These are also used to evaluate the performance of EDWs during meetings that involve a teacher, a fellow EDW, the VSO volunteer and project coordinator.

Lessons learned

By all accounts, the CiMa project has been considered a success in that it has met its objectives as outlined in the logical framework. It has also surpassed many expectations despite the difficult context in which it operated. Below are some of the global lessons from the project:

Appropriate M&E systems must be built into project proposal and design:

While most projects do not usually suffer a long delay between project proposal and implementation due to a civil war, the general lesson to be learned from the CiMa Project is that M&E systems involving all project beneficiaries and stakeholders must be built directly into the project proposal and design.

Although valid reasons existed for submitting the original project proposal as early as possible to the EC once the PO resumed its country programme, the project would have benefited from a new needs assessment and a validation of project objectives, activities and assumptions in light of the very different post-war context in which it was to be implemented. While the project still would have continued to face many complex challenges beyond its control, it may have been able to avoid some of the problems that it encountered in its early implementation stages. It would have been able to capture meaningful data on the progress of teachers participating in the project.

Meaningful participation of all stakeholders: Autonomy from the MoE had both its advantages and disadvantages for the CiMa Project. On the one hand, project activities could more or less continue despite the prevailing labour and financial problems of the education system. Conversely, the lack of any meaningful investment on the part of the

MoE has led to a lack of ownership of the project that threatens long-term sustainability of results. Although nominally a partner in the project, the MoE was not a signatory to the original proposal. The proposal also did not explicitly define what was expected of the MoE in terms of project support and responsibility.

In any national or public education system, standards for teacher training and inspection fall under the authority of government. While it could be argued that an independent NGO as envisioned in the project proposal may be able to run in-service teacher training more effectively and efficiently than government, any future in-service teacher training programme would still need accreditation from the MoE and should dovetail with the pre-service training offered at the National Teacher Training College.

The mid-term evaluation made it clear that the project did not have either the financial or technical means to evolve into a national NGO that could be sustainable without substantial inputs from other implementing INGO partners. Any continuation of the project activities could only be achieved through the financial, technical and human resources investment on the part of the MoE. In its final two years, the project team devoted a lot of time and energy to ensuring various departments within the MoE could assume responsibility for continuing at least some of the project activities, and for maintaining the project assets and the Guinean staff.

Capacity building of Guinean EDWs: One of the most often cited reasons for the success of the project has been the increased number of Guineans hired for the project when it became clear that VSO would not be able to recruit the envisioned number of volunteers. The project invested time and effort into developing the individual capacities of Guinean EDWs beyond teacher training and classroom observation. Although it meant reducing the seminar cycle to include formal and on-the-job training opportunities for the Guinean EDWs, by the final year the project team embodied VSO's motto of sharing skills. As the Guinean EDWs became more competent and confident, more administrative tasks and responsibilities could be delegated to them.

The result is team of eight confident and trained Guinean EDWs who are capable of adapting the project activities for future MoE in-service training programmes

Flexibility and Adaptability: All long-term projects must be flexible and adaptable to a certain extent without losing sight of original objectives and the needs of stakeholders. In the case of the CiMa Project, its ability to respond to the numerous setbacks that it faced is one of the keys to its success.

Arguably, the CiMa Project enjoyed a freedom not ordinarily afforded other co-financed projects to change activities as it needed due to circumstances beyond its control. Project management styles changed with each new coordinator. This also affected the evolution of the project.

Overall the project remained true to the spirit of the original proposal even though it revised the project objectives and activities. Not only was it able to expand its scope to include more schools and teachers than previously envisioned, every year the CiMa Project activities became more responsive to the real needs of both teachers and EDWs. This perhaps is the key lesson behind the success of the CiMa Project.

Roshelle Filart was a VSO education volunteer in Guinea Bissau from 2003 to 2006. She was placed at the Ministry of Education and conducted educational research on community schools for Plan Guinea Bissau. She also provided support to VSO Guinea Bissau's HIV & AIDS Resource Centre. She has a Masters degree in Education.

Annex 1: Summary of original VSO Guinea Bissau INSETT Proposal

Project Objectives

Primary objective

- 1. To establish a team of trained mathematics and science teachers.
- 2. To produce a series of maths and science work books that teacher and students are able and willing to use.

Secondary objectives:

- 1. To maximize regional schools' use of locally available resources, both material and human.
- 2. To establish links for sharing skills and resources between trained and experienced educational personnel in Bissau and Biombo and regional teachers.

Intended beneficiaries

- First year: 44 mathematics, biology, chemistry and physics teachers; incrementally increased to 148 in total as project expanded to cover all 12 secondary schools existing within the project's geographical focus at the time of initial proposal.
- Four MoE seconded Guinean secondary teachers with formal pre-service education and a minimum of five years teaching experience, trained on-the-job to be teacher trainers
- Estimated 1,300 science students in first year, incrementally increased to 8,500 students
- Indirect beneficiaries: Secondary school directors and sub-directors who would see improved achievements in science; families and communities, potentially benefiting economically due to greater higher learning and job opportunities for students who receive sound science and maths education

Project Location

- Four geographic regions covering 12 existing regional secondary secondary schools: Oio, Cacheu, and east (Gabu & Bafata) and south (Quinara, Tombali and Bolama)
- Project Coordinator to be located in VSO Programme Office, Bissau

Project Activities

In-service teacher training programme

- Fortnightly one-day training seminars during the school term
- Regular coaching through observation and feedback during the school term
- Regular team teaching in pairs, involving lesson planning and delivery during the term
- Annual one-week workshop during the long vacation

Collective development of teaching resources

- Creating, adapting & testing classroom materials throughout the INSETT programme
- Developing classroom materials into student workbooks for each phase of the maths and science syllabus for every grade at secondary schools
- Publishing the workbooks and distributing them to all secondary schools

Use of local resources by teachers

- Identifying local organizations with suitable material resources to share with teachers, e.g. libraries and office equipment.
- Negotiating conditions for the use of these resources
- Training teachers in the use of these resources
- Establishing network of local professionals willing to provide career advice to students
- Developing opportunities for these professionals to meet with students

Provision of opportunities for regional teacher to learn from trained and experienced teachers

- Including trained and experienced educational personnel in the annual training workshop
- Co-ordinating short secondments for regional teachers to work in educational establishments in Bissau

Human resources

- Project Co-ordinator: Employed by VSO for the duration of the project, responsible for coordinating all activities, providing professional support to the VSO volunteers, and liaising with partner schools, the MoE and the project committee.
- Eight VSO Volunteer Teacher Trainers: Three volunteers to start in first year, a fourth to be recruited in second year and four more to replace the volunteers at the end of two-year VSO placement. At minimum, volunteers would be qualified secondary science and math teachers if not professional teacher trainers, fluent in Portuguese. One volunteer to be located in each of the project's four regional areas.
- Four Guinean Educational Development Workers: One seconded teacher to work with one VSO volunteer in each regional area for four years of project. Guinean EDWs to be paid regular salaries by MoE, augmented by CiMa Project to the equivalent of VSO volunteers.
- Link Teachers: One "link" teacher identified at every secondary school participating in the CiMa project, either a VSO volunteer teacher or an experienced teacher who had participated in 1997 pilot project. Link teachers to be responsible for providing logistical support to the project EDWs, e.g. coordinating classroom observation, booking classrooms for training seminars and peer coaching activities. Link teachers to receive their regular MoE salaries plus an additional stipend for performing duties as required by the CiMa Project.
- Project Advisory Committee: Comprised of the project coordinator, and representatives from VSO, the MoE, and the project EDWs to oversee the project and meeting formally at least twice a year and receiving regular updates on the progress of the project.
- Monitoring and evaluation consultant: To be contracted to advise the project on quantitative and qualitative performance indicators and appropriate systems to monitor change and measure impact.

Original budget for four-year project

•	Total Cost of the Project:	Euros 1,194,233	(UK £ 694,040)
•	EC Contribution requested:	Euros 500,000	(UK £ 290,579)
•	VSO Contribution:	Euros 694,233	(UK £ 403,361)

Annex 2: CiMa INSETT Project Facts

Project Start Date: 01 April 2001

Project End Date (after one-year no cost extension): 31 March 2006 **Project Partners:** VSO, European Commission, Ministry of Education

Additional financial support provided by: Premier Oil, individual VSO volunteers

Project Staff

jour oran		D 1.0 1/1	0004 0000	
		Derek Smith	2001 – 2003	
Head Office	Bissau	John Brotherton	2003 – 2005	Project Coordinators
		Ana Teresa Forjaz	2005 – 2006	
	Bula	Eric Morris	2001 – 2003	VSO EDW - Math
	(Cacheu	Jenny Orton	2005 – 2006	VSO EDW - Math
	region)	Marcelo Mendes	2003 – 2006	Guinean EDW - Biology
	region)	Pedro Cá	2001 – 2006	Guinean EDW –Math
		Nuno Aires	2001 – 2003	VSO EDW – Environmental Science
	Mansoa (Oio region)	Luís Correia	2003 – 2005	Guinean EDW - Physics
		Bert Schajkwijk	2003 – 2005	VSO EDW - Pedagogy
Danianal Offices		Bacar Seide	2001 – 2006	Guinean EDW - Chemistry
Regional Offices	Bambadinca (Bafata, Gabu, Tombali &	Belén Cuadrado	2003 – 2004	VSO EDW – Physics/Math
		Bill Ellam	2004 – 2006	VSO EDW – Physics/Chem/Math
		Domingos Mendonça	2003 - 2006	Guinean EDW - Biology
		Zacarias Joaquim	2001 – 2006	Guinean EDW - Chemistry
		Marcelo Mendes	2003 - 2006	Guinean EDW - Math
	Quinara	Jorge Gomes	2001 – 2006	Guinean EDW - Physics
	regions)	Patrick Ullmer	2003 – 2004	VSO EDW – Chemistry/Biology
	Canchungo*	Christa Furst	2001 – 2003	VSO EDW – Biology

^{*}no longer in operation

Project participants 2004/2005

Project participants 2004/2005									
Offices	Regions	Sector L	Liceus	Nº of Teachers					
	i kogionio			Mat.	Biol.	Chem.	Phys.	Total	
		Bula	Bula	3	3	1	2	9	
		0	Ho Chi Minh	6	3	2	4	15	
		Canchungo	ADRA	1	1	-	-	2	
Bula	Cachéu	Pelundo	Pelundo	1	2	-	-	3	
		Cachéu	Cachéu	1	1	-	1	3	
		S. Domingos	Martinho de Carvalho	2	1	1	2	6	
		Ingoré	Ingoré	2	1	1	1	5	
Sub-Total	1	6	7	16	12	5	10	43	
	Oio	Mansoa	Quemo Mane	3	2	1	2	8	
Mansoa		Farim	Titina Sila	3	2	1	2	8	
		Bissorã	Liceu Regional	4	3	2	3	12	
Sub-Total	1	3	3	10	7	4	7	28	
		Bafatá	Hoggy Ya Henda	6	3	1	3	13	
	Bafatá	Bafatá	Bambadinca	Escola Evangélica	1	1	-	-	2
		Darribadirica	Liceu Comunitário	2	4	-	2	8	
Bambadinca	Gabú	Gabú	Fona Luís Tchuda	4	2	2	3	11	
	Quínara	Buba	Siaka Touré	2	1	1	1	5	
	Quillala	Empada	D. Settimio Ferrazeta	2	-	1	1	4	
	Tombalí	Catió	Areolino Cruz	3	1	1	3	8	
Sub-Total	4	6	7	20	12	6	13	51	
TOTAL	5	15	17	46	31	15	30	122	

National Teachers' Conference Attendance

September 2002: 250 teachers, 33 final-year student teachers

September 2003: Cancelled due to military coup

September 2004: 327 teachers out of a total 426 (77%) September 2005: 365 out of an expected 412 (88%)

Annex 3: Timeline of events

Guinea Bissau	VSO Programme Office Jun 2006 Closure of VSO Guinea Bissau Country Programme	CiMa INSETT Project
	Bissau Country Frogramme	Apr 2006 EC External evaluation of project
Dec 2005 Opening of school year delayed due to teachers' strike and cholera epidemic		Mar 2006 Closure of CiMa INSETT Project
Jul 2005 Presidential election		Dec 2005 CiMa Committee Meeting to discuss future of CiMa project Sep 2005 – 3 rd National Teachers' Conference Jul 2005 CiMa Committee Meeting; Mansoa
		volunteer departs Jun 2005 International Children's Day Science
Jun 2005 Early end to school year due to election		Competition April 2005 New Project Coordinator hired Mar 2005 Project Coordinator resigns Feb 2005 New volunteer arrives Bula office
	Jan 2005 Decision to close VSO Country Programme Nov 2004 Visit of VSO CEO; Country Programme Review; opening of VSO HIV & AIDS Resource Centre	Too 2000 Now You and Con an in Con Date Since
Oct 2004 Revolt by renegade soldiers; postponement of donor roundtable		Que apply and Nettern L.T. and an Que forman
	Jul 2004 VSO Partner Workshop to review programme	Sep 2004 2 nd National Teachers Conference Jul 2004 Bambadinca volunteers depart; new volunteer arrives Jun 2004 International Children's Day Science Competition
Mar 2004 Parliamentary Elections held	Ian 2004 Now VSO country	
a	Jan 2004 New VSO country director assumes post	5 · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
Oct 2003 World Bank US \$2.5 million loan to pay 10 months of teacher salary arrears ending 4th strike		Oct 2003 4 Guinean EDWs recruited; Bambadinca office opened; CiMa Committee Meeting
Sep 2003 Military Coup ousts President; Transitional Governing Council appointed		Sep 2003 National Teacher's Conference cancelled; new Project coordinator hired
		Aug 2003 2 volunteers arrive to set up Bambadinca office
Mar 2003 4 th strike begins		Feb 2003 Mansoa volunteer departs; new volunteer arrives
Jan 2003 3 rd strike ends Jul 2002 3 rd strike begins		
Feb 2002 2 nd strike		Jun 2002 New volunteer for Bafata office arrives; early return for personal reasons; mid-project review Feb 2002 2 Guinean EDWs hired for Canchungo & Mansoa offices
Nov 2001 Teachers' strike ends;		Dec 2001 Volunteer from Farim & 1 from Canchungo relocate to Mansoa; office/resource centre opens
Interim Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper drafted Oct 2001 Primary school fees abolished		Oct 2001 Seminars begin
Jul 2001 Teachers' strike begins May 2001 IMF, World Bank suspend aid over missing funds		Jul 2001 Project Coordinator assumes post
suspend and over missing runds	Dec 2000 New VSO Country	Apr 2001 CiMa begins with 3 new volunteers; 1 in Farim, 2 in Canchungo Feb 2001 EC agrees to co-finance project
	Director assumes post	Nov 2000 Project proposal resubmitted; Recruitment

Jan 2000 Presidential election 1999 War ends Jun 1998 Civil war breaks out 1998 World Bank Project to Support Basic Education (Firkidja) introduced	Sep 2000 VSO programme reopens, 4 new volunteers arrive; work resumes on teacher training project proposal Jun 1998 VSO programme suspended; volunteers evacuated 1998 - National education workshop to discuss teacher training 1996 VSO volunteer teachers begin voluntary teacher training	for project coordinator and volunteers begins 1998 Proposal for EC/VSO co-financing of INSETT project developed 1997 Pilot project for INSET involving 3 VSO volunteers in Oio region
1994 1st multi-party elections 1989 World Bank Social Infrastructure Reconstruction Project	workshops 1994 VSO in partnership with MoE begins recruiting secondary science & maths teachers	
1988 - Peace Corps opens programme in Guinea Bissau, recruiting English Language Teachers for secondary <i>liceus</i> and teacher training college 1974 Independence from Portugal	1988 VSO opens office in Bissau; begins recruiting volunteers to work in primary health care in the regions	
Guinea Bissau	VSO Country Programme	CiMa INSETT Project

Annex 4: Logical Framework for CiMa INSETT Project 2003

Intervention Logic	Objectively Verifiable Indicators of Achievement	Sources and Means of Verification	Assumptions
OVERALL OBJECTIVE:			
To support teachers of Maths and Sciences in the regions in improving the quality of teaching; competence and confidence in their subject knowledge; and attitude towards their role as teachers.	Set targets achieved by the middle of the academic year 2004-05, unless otherwise specified.	 On going M&E data collection by EDWs and project coordinator. Final Project evaluation. 	Migration to the cities does not cause significant depletion of trained staff in regional schools.
SPECIFIC OBJECTIVES:			
To improve the quality of teaching by helping teachers to develop their existing teaching techniques and giving them opportunities to experience and practice alternatives.	classroom (50% of teachers double the number of	Lesson Observation sheets. Attendance sheet for Seminars/National Conference. Questionnaires/interviews about 'Agenda' usage. Questionnaires/interviews with students.	 Academic year is not significantly disrupted by strikes. Salaries are paid to all members of the educational community. School directors arrange timetables to allow teachers to
To support teachers in developing greater understanding of their academic disciplines and the ability to pass this on to their students.	 50% of teachers attempting at least one teaching topic within the curriculum, which they previously avoided. 50% of teachers introduce an experiment (sciences) or an investigation (mathematics) at least once a term. All schools have and use student workbooks for at least one subject in one year group by academic year 2005-06. 	 Lesson Observation sheets. Questionnaires at the National Conference. 	attend seminars. Suitable national staff can be recruited as EDWs. Good working relationships with the MoE and related institutions.
To raise self-esteem and standards of professional behaviour of teachers in regional secondary schools.	 Reduction in teacher absence from lessons by 50%. 50% more lessons start on time. 	School records.Lesson Observations.	
To give project participants the skills and confidence necessary to continue the project.	 National EDWs take on responsibilities in the running of the regional offices by the beginning of the next academic year (October 2004) and the project as a whole by January 2006. 	 EDW appraisal system (including key points such as planning ability, use of M&E and ability to do accounts). Evaluations of INSETT seminars. 	

Annex 5: Logical Framework for VSO/EU INSETT Project (CiMa) - revised October 2005

Logical Intervention	Objectively Verifiable Indicators of Achievement	Sources and Means of Verification	Assumptions
OVERALL OBJECTIVE:			•
To support teachers of Maths and Sciences in the regions in improving the quality of teaching; competence and confidence in their subject knowledge; and attitude towards their role as teachers.	Establishes the goals to be achieved during the school year 2005-2006 (10/05-03/06) * Have to be: SMART - Specific, Measurable, Achievable, Realistic, Time-bound	 On going M&E data collection by EDWs and project coordinator Revision of results in January and up-dated indicators Final evaluations of Project (CiMa Team and External) 	
SPECIFIC OBJECTIVES:			•
To improve the quality of teaching by helping teachers to develop their existing teaching techniques and giving them opportunities to experience and practice alternatives.	 70% of observed teachers prepare a lesson plan. 60% of observed teachers use different and alternative methods 90% of observed teachers use handbook or the Texts and Exercises 75% of observed teachers use Teacher's Agenda 10% of observed teachers make practical experiences. 95% of the seminars include at least four teaching methods 50% of the students participate actively in the assessed lessons. 	 Lesson Observation Sheet (LOS) LOS LOS LOS LOS Seminar Observation Sheet (SOS) LOS – taking appointments during lesson and observing the %. 	 School year begins and ends on time. Teachers' salaries will be
To support teachers in developing greater understanding of their academic disciplines and the ability to pass this on to their students.	 85% of Project teachers have access to the Kit. 90% of observed teachers use the handbook or the Texts and Exercises 70% of teachers participate at the seminars, referring to the texts and exercises and to the syllabus. 100% of seminars have practical experiences and activities 90% of non-project science & maths teachers in teachers in Bubaque e Bolama-Bijagós participate in an intensive seminar 	 Verifying the distribution LOS SOS Control presence on the seminars lists 	paid The School Director unable the teacher's participation at the seminars
To raise self-esteem and standards of professional behaviour of teachers in regional secondary schools.	 70% of teachers receive a certificate of the INSETT/CiMa. 90% of observed teachers use handbook or Texts and Exercises. 75% of observed teachers use the Teachers Agenda During seminars, teachers exchange ideas and consult colleagues 	 Certificates LOS LOS LOS and asking during the assessment SOS 	providing an appropriate schedule Good working relations
To give project participants the skills and confidence necessary to continue the project.	 100% of Guinean EDWs receive a certificate for English lessons A proposal for continuation of the Project has been written. 100% of Guinean EDWs receive a certificate as teacher trainers from INSETT/CiMa 20% of the EDWs participate actively in the INSETT/CiMa Committee 	 Certificates Project proposal Certificates Minutes from the INSETT/CiMa Committee 	between MoE and NGOs